



# ANTHROPOLOGY & MISSION

ed. by the Anthropos Institute

N° 64

Sankt Augustin, December 2021

*We would like to remind our readers that, strictly speaking, we are not reviewing the books and articles presented here (in the sense of giving a critical assessment of their contents) but intend to draw the readers' attention to the publications that are of particular interest for those who are engaged with both – anthropology and mission. The material in the bulletin partly consists of quotes taken from the presented books and articles.*

## Review of Books

(by Vinsenius Adi Gunawan and Othmar Gächter)

**Schroeder, Roger P., SVD:** Christian Tradition in Global Perspective. Maryknoll: Orbis Book, 2021. 317 pp. ISBN 978-1-62698-434-9. (pbk)

In 2004 Roger Schröder published with Steve Bevans theological “Constants in Context” of today’s missiology. Now he presents a Catholic picture of Christian tradition/s and their agents from a global perspective, i.e. taking into account Western and non-Western perspectives. He understands by “Tradition ... the way that the faith we believe today is the same faith that Christians *have always* and *will always believe*” and he reminds the reader that tradition is not just content, but a “*sense* and a *love* of faith,” realized in “the ‘process’ of passing on, internalizing, and shaping the Christian faith in new contexts. It is the faith of the church in action... Tradition is both what is passed and the process of the passing” (xv).

He recounts the Catholic path in a historical context: constants, developments, conflicts, and contradictions through eight key historical periods. Special attention is paid to scripture, liturgy, sacraments, art, ministry organization, spiritual-religious social movements in various social and political contexts. He informs well about the theological basics of Christian tradition(s) and the difficulty of the translational character of Christianity, of symbols, and devotion, while emphasizing the relationship between mission, cultures, and religious movements. Thus, one notes that there are accommodational approaches to the cultural-religious world in pastoral responsibility step by step. And last but not least, there was a “shift in understanding cul-

tures, the post-Vatican Catholic Church ... assumed a positive attitude toward other religions” (291). Schroeder’s global perspective is: “The church is not just an institution but also the emergence of a movement.”

**Grodź Stanislaw, Sebastian M. Michael, and Roger Schroeder** (eds.): Giants’ Footprints. 90th Anniversary of Anthropos Institute (1931–2021). Baden-Baden: Academia, 2021. 358 pp. ISBN 978-3-98572-014-9. (pbk)

The volume contains the past and present story of Anthropos Institute, which grew around the journal Anthropos and its founder Wilhelm Schmidt. The book is divided into three sections. The first outlines the history of the Institute, presents the early co-workers of Schmidt, gives an insider’s perspective on the development of the journal and opens a new look at Schmidt’s leading concept. Section two introduces various local outreach efforts of the Institute in Japan, India, Brazil, Ghana, and Papua New Guinea. Finally, some members present their current work. The collection is complemented by an outsider’s assessment of the Institute’s engagement. The appendix includes a list of all the members of the Institute.

**Parkin, Robert:** How Kinship Systems Change: On the Dialectics of Practice and Classification. New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2021. 310 pp. ISBN 978-1-80073-166-0. (hbk)

Using some of his landmark publications on kinship, along with a new introduction, chapter and conclusion, Robert Parkin discusses here the changes in kinship terminologies and marriage practices, as well as the dialectics between them. The chapters also focus on a suggested trajectory, linking South Asia and Europe and the specific question of the status of Crow-Omaha systems. The collection culminates in the argument that, whereas marriage systems and practices seem infinitely varied when examined from a very close perspective, the terminologies that accompany them are much more restricted.

*Dwight Read:* Accounts of kinship terminology evolution either have mostly focused on single, or a few, regions without placing the account into a larger context... Parkin provides a far more complete account based on extensive empirical evidence regarding the world-wide variations among kinship terminologies.

**Sagir, Fatma** (ed.): *Rocking Islam. Music and the Making of New Muslim Identities.* Münster: Waxmann Verlag, 2021. 190 pp. ISBN 978-3-8309-4396-9. (pbk) Music has the universal power to move individuals, peoples and societies. Music is one of the most important signifiers of cultural change. It is also most significant for youth movements and youth cultures. While Islam has a historically and traditionally rich culture of music, religious controversy on the topic of music is still ongoing. However, young Muslims in today's globalized world seek pop cultural tools such as music, and particularly hip hop music, as way of exploring and expressing their manifold identities, whilst challenging Islamophobia, stigma and racism on the one hand and traditional and religious challenges on the other hand.

In this volume, following an international conference with the same title, scholars and young academics from a variety of disciplines seek to explore and highlight the phenomena surrounding the two, somewhat artificially separated, realms of music and religion. The contributions not only look into different genres of music, from Tunisian metal over German female hip hop to Egyptian folk, but take the reader on a journey from continent to countries to cities and rural areas and thus give space and time to a widely neglected area of research: that of Muslim popular culture and young Muslims.

**Layton, Robert** (ed.): *The Anthropology of Displaced Communities.* Canon Pyon: Sean Kingston Publishing, 2020. 266 pp. ISBN 978-1-912385-22-5. (hbk)

This collection highlights the work of the Royal Anthropological Institute's Urgent Anthropology Fellowships fund, which supports research into communities whose culture and social life are under immediate threat. Created by George Appell in response to the distress he experienced working with a traumatized community of swidden cultivators in Borneo, who were struggling to survive after relocation in what Appell

describes as a "cultural concentration camp", the fund was established to identify ways of supporting and strengthening such communities through ethnographic work.

Since 1995, Urgent Anthropology Fellows have worked with many displaced communities, whether found in refugee camps, resettled in kindred communities across national borders or in environments hostile to their traditional way of life; or whether suffering from the aftermath of civil war or the intrusion of foreigners in search of minerals. Despite the diversity of circumstances in these case studies, this book shows some of the common strategies that emerge in helping displaced communities regain some control over their own destinies. These include membership of social networks, access to natural resources, land ownership and self-sufficiency, autonomy in local judicial procedures and economic activities as well as the celebration of traditional rituals, all of which lessen the potential powerlessness of displaced communities.

**Bert, Jean-François:** *Le courage de comparer. L'anthropologie subversive de Marcel Mauss.* Genève: Éditions Labor et Fides, 2021. 148 pp. ISBN 978-2-8309-1755-0. (pbk)

La démarche comparative que l'anthropologue Marcel Mauss (1872–1950) élabore en grande partie avec son jumeau de travail, l'historien Henri Hubert, entre la fin du xix<sup>e</sup> siècle et le début du xx<sup>e</sup> siècle, relève de logiques multiples. Comme méthode, elle est une stricte et minutieuse approche philologique des sources. Comme état d'esprit, elle relève d'une manière d'apprivoiser l'inconnu. Comme perspective critique, elle constitue un formidable outil scientifique d'objectivisation de la recherche, en particulier en histoire des religions.

Cet ouvrage se propose de montrer quels ont été les principaux effets de ce comparatisme ni systématique, encore moins achevé, mais que l'on peut reconstituer en suivant la manière dont Marcel Mauss aborda certains phénomènes religieux, comme le sacrifice, la magie ou la prière.

Ceci n'est pas seulement un nouveau livre sur Mauss et sur sa manière d'observer les phénomènes sociaux. C'est un livre sur les effets d'un comparatisme radical et subversif qui ne laisse jamais en paix celui qui décide de le mettre en œuvre pour explorer et comprendre la diversité humaine.

**Tulaszewski, Martin, Klaus Hock und Thomas Klie** (Hrsg.): *Was Heilung bringt. Krankheitsdeutung zwischen Religion, Medizin und Heilkunde.* Bielefeld: transcript Verlag, 2020. 216 pp. ISBN 978-3-8376-5042-6. (pbk)

Im Bereich "Heilung und Heil" sind kulturell neue Übergangsformen zwischen religiösem Heilsversprechen und medizinischer Heilung zu beobachten. Diese lassen sich als therapeutische Zugänge sinnstiftender

Art beschreiben. Für das alternativmedizinische Heilungsfeld ist dabei eine selbstbestimmte Suche des modernen Menschen nach Ausdrucksformen, die das eigene "höhere Selbst" entfalten, charakteristisch. Dadurch eröffnen sich neue Sozialformen von religiöser, religionshybrider, aber auch religionsdistanzierter Art, in denen mit der Suche nach diesem "höheren Selbst" die Entwicklung der menschlichen Identität in den Mittelpunkt drängt.

Die Beiträge im ersten Teil des Buches entfalten zunächst das Feld, indem diverse therapeutische Praktiken und ihre religionshybriden Alternativen beispielhaft vorgestellt werden. Der zweite Teil nimmt "Heil und Heilung" mit der Fokussierung auf Fragen transzendenzoffener Ganzheitlichkeit und nach der Bedeutung eines funktionalen, religiös imprägnierenden Zusammenhalts in den Blick. Im dritten, abschließenden Teil geht es schwerpunktmäßig um konzeptuelle und theoretische Spannungsbögen zwischen Religion und alternativen Heilungsangeboten.

**Gribaldo, Alessandra:** *Unexpected Subjects. Intimate Partner Violence, Testimony, and the Law.* Chicago: Hau Books, 2021. 148 pp. ISBN 978-1-912808-30-4. (pbk)

"Unexpected Subjects" is an ethnography of the encounter between women's words and the demands of the law in the context of adjudications on intimate partner violence. A study of institutional devices, it focuses on women's practices of resistance and the elicitation of intelligible subjectivities. Using Italy as an illustrative case, Alessandra Gribaldo explores the problematic encounter between the need to speak, the entanglement of violence and intimacy, and the way the law approaches domestic violence. On this basis, she advances theoretical reflections on questions of evidence, persuasion, and testimony, and their implications for ethnographic theory. Gribaldo analyzes dynamics that create the victim-subject, shedding light on how the Italian legal system reproduces broader conditions of violence against women. This book will be of interest to all social scientists concerned with gender and the law.

**Tamer, Georges (ed.):** *The Concept of Peace in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.* Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2020. 176 pp. ISBN 978-3-11-068193-2. (pbk)

The eighth volume of the series "Key Concepts of Interreligious Discourses" investigates the roots of the concept of "peace" in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam and its relevance for the present time. The book offers fundamental knowledge about specific understanding of peace in the Sacred Scriptures of Judaism, Christianity and Islam as well as the manifold discourses about the concept of peace within these three traditions. It unfolds commonalities and differences among the monotheistic religions as well as their relationship to secular views on peace.

**Zeiler, Xenia (ed.):** *Digital Hinduism.* London and New York: Routledge, 2020. 282 pp. ISBN 978-1-03-208648-4 (pbk)

Digital Religion does not simply refer to religion as it is carried out online, but more broadly studies how digital media interrelate with religious practice and belief. This collection explores Digital Hinduism and consequentially studies how Hinduism is expressed in the digital sphere and how Hindus utilise digital media. Highlighting digital Hinduism and including case studies with foci on India, Asia and the global Hindu diaspora, this book features contributions from an interdisciplinary and international panel of academics. The chapters focus on specific case studies, which in summary exemplify the wide variety and diversity of what constitutes Digital Hinduism today.

Applying methods and research questions from various disciplinary backgrounds appropriate to the study of religion and digital culture, such as Religious Studies, South Asian Studies, Anthropology and Media, and Communication Studies, this book is vital reading for any scholar interested in the relationship between religion and the digital world.

**Suciyani, Talin:** *Armenierinnen und Armenier in der Türkei. Postgenozidale Gesellschaft, Politik und Geschichte.* Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2021. 280 pp. ISBN 978-3-11-065384-7. (hbk)

Talin Suciyani stellt eine andere Geschichte der Türkei vor, eine Geschichte, in deren Zentrum die Überlebenden des Völkermordes an den Armenierinnen und Armeniern im Jahre 1915 sowie deren Nachfahren und ihre Quellen stehen. Suciyani hat erstmals die Veröffentlichungen des Istanbuler Patriarchates, zahlreiche armenischsprachige Zeitschriften, Jahrbücher und weitere schriftliche Primärquellen sowie eigene Interviews mit Quellen aus türkischen staatlichen Archiven zusammengebracht und wissenschaftlich ausgewertet. Anhand dieses umfangreichen Materials zeigt sie, dass der Alltag der armenischen Community wie der gesamten türkischen Gesellschaft geprägt ist von der permanenten Leugnung des Völkermordes, die den türkischen Staat vor, aber auch nach der Gründung der Republik auf allen Ebenen durchzieht. Welche Art von Gesellschaft hat sich so in den letzten hundert Jahren gebildet? Und wie haben Überlebende und Nachkommen in dieser Leugnungsgesellschaft gelebt?

*Rainer Hermann:* „Mit vielen Beispielen aus dem Alltag zeichnet Suciyani nach, was das bedeutet hat: Razzien, die Enteignung von Immobilien der Gemeinde, die Entführung schulpflichtiger Mädchen, die willkürlich praktizierte Wehrpflicht für die Mitglieder der Minderheiten, das Verbot von Armenischen Publikationen. [...] Das Ziel war: Die Armenier sollten assimiliert werden oder das Land verlassen. [...] Talin Suciyani zeigt in ihrer weit ausholenden Studie, wie die Armenier trotz antiarmenischer Kampagnen überleben konnten und überlebten.“

**Reinart, Regina:** Die Amazonien-Synode als Chance und Herausforderung der Mission. Der Imperativ des Umweltschutzes, der Stärkung der indigenen Völker und des Aufbaus indigener Ortskirchen. Siegburg: Franz Schmitt Verlag, 2021. 448 pp. ISBN 978-3-87710-557-3. (pbk)

Wie sehr alles mit allem verbunden ist, zeigt sich im artenreichen Amazonasgebiet, welches in allen neun südamerikanischen Anrainerländern in seiner Existenz bedroht ist. Landraub, die stetig expandierende Agrarindustrie und ein ungebremster Rohstoffabbau prägen die Region mit mehr als 300 indigenen Völkern.

Forderungen zum Schutz des Regenwaldes und seiner Bevölkerung lassen auch die Theologie nicht unberührt. Der Ruf nach einer integralen Ökologie und einer Kirche mit amazonischem Antlitz wurde mit der im Oktober 2019 in Rom veranstalteten Amazonien-Synode deutlich – um sie geht es in dieser Studie.

Die autochthonen Völker und ihr Überlebenskampf werden beispielhaft an der Ethnie der Munduruku erörtert. Anthropologische und linguistische Erkenntnisse sowie die Darstellung ihrer Kosmologie ermöglichen einen Praxisbezug zum theoretischen Teil der Synodendokumente. Erstmals in deutscher Sprache werden Schlüsseltexte wie das sog. *Morumbi-Dokument* und der *Indigenen-Leitfaden* sowie ein Briefwechsel zwischen Papst Franziskus und dem Munduruku-Bischof Wilmar Santin vorgestellt. Das Glaubenszeugnis von Leitfiguren wie des Missionars Hugo Mense und des Märtyrers Vicente Cañas sowie aktuelle, erfahrene und kritische Stimmen kommen zu Wort. Auf eine Gegenüberstellung des Schlussdokumentes und der Exhortation *Querida Amazonia* folgt die Bezugnahme zur weltweiten Bedeutung der Synode. Die Option für die Schöpfung und für die Indigenen getreu des Auftrags der Amazonien-Synode spielt eine wesentliche Rolle. Die Entwicklung eines Amazonien-Ritus bleibt Hauptaufgabe der postsynodalen amazonischen Kirche, auf dem Weg der Umkehr – sozial, kulturell, ökologisch und synodal – in diesem „Gemeinsamen Haus“.

**Schulz, Michael, and Roberto Hofmeister Pich** (eds.): Philosophy of Religion in Latin America and Europe. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht Verlag, 2020. 279 pp. ISBN 978-3-8471-1290-7. (hbk)

The title of this publication suggests a double meaning: on the one hand, most of the contributions outline philosophies of religion relevant for Latin America, without, however, betraying an explicit Latin American perspective. Does not philosophical reason always articulate itself in the same way, whether in Berlin or Rio de Janeiro? On the other hand, the title refers to a specific form of philosophy that has developed regionally and bears explicit traces of its origins that differentiate it from philosophy in Europe. Does not philosophical reason always articulate itself in a specific cultural context? The charm of the book lies in the encounter of these two variants to think philosophically.

**Kah, Henry Kam, and Bea Lundt** (eds./Hrsg.): Polygamous Ways of Life Past and Present in Africa and Europe. Polygame Lebensweisen in Vergangenheit und Gegenwart in Afrika und Europa. Wien: Lit Verlag, 2020. 418 pp. ISBN 978-3-643-91142-1. (pbk)

Marriage and family are changing a lot in the present time; especially migration confronts with different lifestyles in the globalized societies. Polygamy is a very complex phenomenon with a long tradition in Africa, but also in Europe – quite the contrary to the common self-portrayals of the Western World. The anthology will contribute to the objectification of the discussion by portraying the variety of polygamous lifestyles showing the interconnections of family structure, social and economic conditions, cultural representations (especially in fictive writing and oral tradition), spiritual meaning and religious legitimation of this way of life between traditional belief, Christianity, and Islam. Case studies from different countries in Africa south of the Sahara will be added by historic examples since anti-iquity in Europe up to the discussion in present times.

**Bataringaya, Pascal, et al.** (eds.): Overcoming Violence. Challenges and Theological Responses in the Context of Central Africa and Europe. Wien: Lit Verlag, 2021. 259 pp. ISBN 978-3-643-91207-7. (pbk)

On the occasion of the 25th anniversary of the genocide in Rwanda and coinciding with the intensification of violent attacks on the civilian population in the East Kivu region of the Democratic Republic of Congo scholars and students from Rwanda, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Kenya, Cameroon, South Africa, Germany, Austria, Bosnia-Herzegovina and Switzerland joined together in Rwanda to discuss the topic “Overcoming violence”. This volume is a documentation of the lectures of this conference, organized by the Protestant Institute of Arts and Social Sciences (PIASS) in Butare, the Presbyterian Church of Rwanda (EPR) and the Faculty of Protestant Theology of the Ruhr-University Bochum (RUB). The ecumenical orientation of the conference with representatives of the Roman Catholic Church, mainstream Protestantism and Pentecostal churches presented important aspects of learning in diversity.

**Welz, Martin:** Africa since Decolonization. The History and Politics of a Diverse Continent. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021. 375 pp. ISBN 978-1-108-47488-7. (pbk)

Home to more than 1.2 billion people, living in 54 recognized states, speaking around 3,000 languages, Africa is a diverse and complex continent made up of states, which differ in regard to their colonial history, political system, socioeconomic development, economic policies, and their experience with crises and conflicts.

This introduction and overview of African history and politics since decolonization emphasizes throughout, the diversity of the continent. Organized thematically to include chapters on decolonization and its legacies, external influences, economics, political systems, inter-African relations, crises, conflicts and conflict management, and Africa's external relations, Martin Welz strikes a fine balance between the use of contextual information, analysis, case studies, and examples with theoretical debates in development, politics, and global policy. Accessible to students at all levels, it counters histories that offer reductive explanations of complex issues, and offers new insights into the role African actors have played in influencing international affairs beyond the continent.

**Knodel, Kathrin:** Für alle Fälle einen Hahn im Kofferraum. Die Bedeutung des Brautpreises in Burkina Faso. Frankfurt am Main: kula Verlag, 2021. 248 pp. ISBN 978-3-945340-06-6. (pbk)

Was sind die Bedingungen soziokulturellen Wandels? Wie wird er von unterschiedlichen Mitgliedern einer Gesellschaft bewertet und welche gesellschaftlichen Ausdifferenzierungsprozesse und Spannungen entstehen dadurch?

Die Autorin behandelt diese Fragen am Beispiel des Brautpreises in Burkina Faso. Zum einen geht sie dessen normativen Aspekten nach: Welche Güter überreicht die Familie eines Bräutigams einer Brautfamilie bei der entsprechenden Zeremonie? Was gehört zum Brautpreis dazu und welche Bedeutungen verbergen sich dahinter? Zum anderen geht es in diesem Buch um die Spielräume und Aushandlungsfelder, die sich die beteiligten Akteure und Akteurinnen eröffnen und nach ihren jeweiligen Wertvorstellungen gestalten. Die Zugehörigkeit zu einer bestimmten Generation oder Glaubensgemeinschaft, der urbane Lebensstil und die Rechtsprechung spielen hierbei eine entscheidende Rolle.

Damit geht es in dieser Monografie genauso um das konkrete Handeln bei Zeremonien wie um den Diskurs und das fast beiläufige Reden über den richtigen, den angemessenen, den viel zu hohen oder auch den missverstandenen Brautpreis.

**Hagberg, Sten (éd.):** Sécurité par le bas. Perceptions et perspectives citoyennes des défis de sécurité au Burkina Faso. Uppsala: Uppsala Universitet, 2019. 109 pp. ISBN 978-91-506-2794-7. (pbk)

Cette étude porte sur la sécurité par le bas au Burkina Faso, notamment les manières dont les citoyens perçoivent et vivent les défis de sécurité. A travers une entrée par la commune, elle s'intéresse à l'interface entre les enjeux locaux et les insécurités multiples: attaques armées, terrorisme, crime organisé, délinquances, exactions et bavures des forces de sécurité, pauvreté, insécurité alimentaire, etc. L'étude met les nouvelles

initiatives de sécurité (Forum national de sécurité, la Force conjointe du G5 Sahel, groupes d'autodéfense, etc.) en perspective, car elle vise à comprendre les réalités et les « vues et vécues » des acteurs socio-politiques locaux et des citoyens ordinaires.

L'étude est le fruit d'un travail collectif. Une équipe d'anthropologues a d'abord mené les recherches de terrain dans 13 communes burkinabè pour ensuite analyser les matériaux ethnographiques afin de rédiger le présent document ensemble. Les perspectives citoyennes de sécurité, l'ancien régime, la crise malienne, et la criminalité transfrontalière, sont analysées à côté des perceptions populaires de l'État burkinabè. L'émergence des groupes d'auto-défense, particulièrement les Dozos, Koglweogos et Roughas, est contextualisée, suivie d'une analyse des initiatives locales pour la sécurité, telles que l'engagement contre la radicalisation et la mobilisation des femmes. Comment vivre les insécurités – notamment les questions de sécurité alimentaire, de chômage et d'emploi et gérer la peur – est analysé en détail sur la base des connaissances approfondies des terrains de recherché.

**Cohen, Adrienne J.:** Infinite Repertoire. On Dance and Urban Possibility in Postsocialist Guinea. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2021. 190 pp. ISBN 978-0-226-78102-0. (pbk)

In Guinea's capital city of Conakry, dance is everywhere. Most neighborhoods boast at least one dance troupe, and members of those troupes animate the city's major rites of passage and social events. Adrienne Cohen in "Infinite Repertoire" shows how dance became such a prominent – even infrastructural – feature of city life in Guinea, a surprising story of the rise of creative practice under a political regime known for its authoritarianism and violent excesses.

Guinea's socialist state, which was in power from 1958 to 1984, used staged African dance or "ballet" strategically as a political tool. Far from dying with the decline of socialism, Guinean ballet continued to thrive in Conakry after economic liberalization in the 1980s, as its association with transformative power was adapted to a market economy and a rapidly expanding city. "Infinite Repertoire" follows young dancers and percussionists in Conakry as they invest in the present by using their bodies to build a creative urban environment, performing and redefining social norms and political subjectivities passed down from the socialist generation before them.

Cohen's inventive ethnography weaves the political with the aesthetic, placing dance at the center of a story about dramatic political change and youthful resourcefulness in one of the least-studied cities on the African continent.

**Thiel, Josef Franz:** Les Bayansi du bassin du Congo. Frankfurt: Frobenius-Institut, 2020. 283 pp. ISBN 978-3-981707-1-8. (pbk)

En 2001, Josef Franz Thiel a publié en allemand ses expériences de missionnaire et d'ethnologue avec les Bayansi au Congo. Heureusement, l'Institut Frobenius de Francfort présente à nouveau de manière structurée la documentation de ses expériences avec les Bayansi et son interprétation du peuple en français. En introduction (9–10), Bernard Dr. Fansaca Biniama écrit à juste titre : “On a la joie de voir défiler, dans cet ouvrage, des données de l'organisation politique des Bayansi, à savoir les systèmes de pouvoirs traditionnels ainsi que de personnages historiques marquants comme l'emblématique Tatsiar.” Il informe sur l'organisation religieuse, prêtre de la divinité de la terre, les esprits, les sorciers, les visionnaires, les guérisseurs, les ancêtres, les fétiches ainsi que les tabous que tout cela entraîne. Thiel souligne également que “la symbolique pénètre et traverse toute la vie du peuple yansi avec la grande importance accordée au chiffre neuf (*wa* ou bien *mina twa*): la perfection spirituelle et sociale. ... Coulé dans un style simple de la narration, cet ouvrage pourra permettre à ses informateurs une lecture facile.”

**Rutert, Britta:** *Contested Properties. Peoples, Plants, and Politics in Post-Apartheid South Africa.* Bielefeld: transkript Verlag, 2020. 354 pp. ISBN 978-3-8376-4794-5. (pbk)

This book deals with the values of medicinal plants and associated knowledge(s) in the field of bioprospecting in post-apartheid South Africa. Bioprospecting, the use of genetic or biological resources for commercial purposes, is a profit-oriented enterprise facing new challenges with the rise of human rights and biodiversity politics. This new situation has led to claims for political leverage made by indigenous communities, as well as to claims for national and local cultural identity and heritage. The picture presented here contributes to the widely discussed yet so far unresolved question of how to appropriately share benefits, and how to protect indigenous knowledge in this field.

**Rahder, Micha:** *An Ecology of Knowledges. Fear, Love, and Technoscience in Guatemalan Forest Conservation.* Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2020. 336 pp. ISBN 978-1-4780-0691-6. (pbk)

Guatemala's Maya Biosphere Reserve (MBR), the largest protected area in Central America, is characterized by rampant violence, social and ethnic inequality, and rapid deforestation. Faced with these threats, local residents, conservationists, scientists, and NGOs in the region work within what Micha Rahder calls “an ecology of knowledges,” in which interventions on the MBR landscape are tied to differing and sometimes competing forms of knowing. In this book, Rahder examines how technoscience, endemic violence, and an embodied love of wild species and places shape conservation practices in Guatemala. Rahder highlights how different forms of environmental knowledge

emerge from encounters and relations between humans and nonhumans, institutions and local actors, and how situated ways of knowing impact conservation practices and natural places, often in unexpected and unintended ways. In so doing, she opens up new ways of thinking about the complexities of environmental knowledge and conservation in the context of instability, inequality, and violence around the world.

*Marisol de la Cadena:* This book is replete with intriguing ethnographic material located at the crossroads of histories of violence and practices of conservation. Its themes and depictions of the problematic relation between state, ecology, globalization, and violence – along with its siting in a globally recognized ecological zone – are all extremely compelling features that will appeal to scholars and students, NGO workers, conservation officials, and even governmental organizations.

**Cuartero, Izaskun Álvarez, and Alberto Baena Zapatero** (eds.): *En compañía de salvajes: el sujeto indígena en la construcción del otro.* Madrid and Frankfurt am Main: Iberoamericana, Verfuert, 2021. 292 pp. ISBN 978-84-9192-211-7. (pbk)

El libro presenta once trabajos sobre un debate historiográfico, el estudio de cómo se construyeron y asimilaron las diferencias humanas y culturales. Aunque concede una atención especial a América hasta el siglo XIX, integra otros espacios relacionados con la España colonial como Filipinas o Marruecos. La percepción del otro, comenzando por quién designa y es designado como otro, no es un tema nuevo en la historiografía, pero sigue vigente por su capacidad de integrar las visiones de dominadores y dominados, por su metodología interdisciplinar (representada en el libro por la colaboración de historiadores, historiadores del arte o antropólogos) y por la naturaleza universal de algunas de sus conclusiones, las cuales permiten relacionarlo con el presente.

En resumen, una propuesta amplia e integradora que interroga al pasado sobre un tema definitorio del ser humano y que, por eso, nunca deja de ser actual. Quizás, si comprendemos los fenómenos de identidad y alteridad como construcciones culturales, podamos favorecer la formación de sociedades más respetuosas y pacíficas.

**Sánchez-Albornoz, Nicolás:** *Trabajo y migración indígenas en los Andes coloniales.* Lima: Instituto de Estudios Peruanos, 2020. 282 pp. ISBN 978-9972-51-996-3. (pbk)

Una de las áreas más sacudida por la ocupación europea de América en el siglo XVI fue, sin duda, la del trabajo indígena. Fue este, como lo manifestaron los testigos de la época repetidas veces, el que permitió la extracción de la plata y su traslado hasta los puertos de embarque, así como la construcción de las ciudades y las iglesias

cuya magnificencia hoy nos asombra. ¿Cómo se organizó el trabajo indígena, de modo que se evitara la hecatombe demográfica que ocurrió en el Caribe, pero a la vez se pudiera aprovechar el tesoro más grande de estas tierras, que era “la grosedad de los indios”? Este es el tema que ha impulsado los trabajos del notable historiador español Nicolás Sánchez-Albornoz a lo largo de medio siglo.

En este libro reúne nueve estudios, dos de ellos inéditos, acerca de las diferentes concepciones sobre el trabajo que había en la sociedad andina y en la europea, la implantación de la mita en diferentes contextos (no solamente el minero), las migraciones indígenas rural-rural o rural-urbana que acontecieron durante el primer siglo que siguió a la Conquista, y el comercio de mulas desde el norte argentino hacia el Perú en el siglo XVIII. Como ocurrió antes en otras partes del mundo, la mula fue progresivamente sustituyendo el trabajo de los indígenas como cargadores y dotó a la economía de una fuerza motriz que antes no había tenido. Los estudios publicados previamente han sido actualizados por el autor para esta edición que puede considerarse, así, como la definitiva.

**Vogel, Tina:** “Libres en el sonido”. *Zeitgenössische Musik gegen die Militärdiktaturen in Chile, Argentinien und Uruguay*. Esslingen, Innsbruck: Helbling, 2021. 202 pp. ISBN 978-3-86227-451-2. (pbk)

Neue Musik in Lateinamerika speist sich in der zweiten Hälfte des 20. Jahrhunderts aus zwei Anliegen: Zum einen aus der Bewusstseinsergreifung nach eigener Identität und der Unabhängigkeit von hegemonialen Machtzentren. Zum anderen aus dem kontinentweiten Bedürfnis nach sozialer Gerechtigkeit und deren Fortbestehen bzw. dem Widerstand während der Niederschlagung alternativer politischer Strukturen durch die Militärdiktaturen der Siebziger- und Achtzigerjahre. Beide Überlegungen finden ihren Niederschlag in musikalischen Strukturen, die sich aus diesem Bestreben heraus mit der tiefgreifenden Wiederinanspruchnahme des präkolumbianischen Erbes sowie der Herausbildung einer eigenen Klangsprache, die sich unabhängig von (neo-) kolonialen Zentren versteht, beschäftigt. Kunstschaffende wie Graciela Paraskevaïdis, Hilda Dianda, Coriún Aharonián, Eduardo Cáceres, Cecilia Cordero, Ulises Ferretti und Juan José Iturrberry gehen während der jüngsten Militärdiktaturen ihrer Länder nicht ins Exil, sondern widmen sich aus dem Innern der Diktaturen heraus einer Form des kulturellen Widerstandes, der die Strukturen und Wege Neuer Musik mit sozialer, politischer und historischer Verantwortung vereint.

Die vorliegende Arbeit nimmt den besonderen historischen und gesellschaftlichen Kontext dieses Musikschaffens in den Fokus. Anhand von zahlreichen Abbildungen, Notenbeispielen und geeigneten Analysen soll untersucht werden, inwiefern und in welcher Form Neue Musik tiefgreifende und nachhaltige Beiträge zu Veränderungen in gesellschaftlichen oder politischen

Strukturen im Lateinamerika des 20. Jahrhunderts liefern kann. Darüber hinaus soll gezeigt werden, welche Bedeutung Kunstprodukten im eigentlichen, übergeordneten Ziel des Kontinents zukommt: der Umkehrung gesellschaftlicher und kultureller Strukturen zugunsten eines gleichberechtigten Dialoges der Kulturen auf Augenhöhe.

**Moreira, Luciana, and Doris Wieser (eds.):** *A flor de cuerpo: representaciones del género y de las disidencias sexo-genéricas en Latinoamérica*. Madrid and Frankfurt am Main: Iberoamericana, Verfuert, 2021. 379 pp. ISBN 978-84-9192-136-3. (pbk)

Este volume colectivo reúne ensayos sobre las representaciones del género y de las disidencias sexo-genéricas en Latinoamérica en el campo cultural (literatura, cine, cómic, teatro, música, fanzines, artes y activismos) y los movimientos sociales. Los ensayos abordan el trabajo de artistas y activistas latinoamericanas queer, feministas y/o antirracistas como una comunidad transnacional y heterogénea. El libro, con un enfoque interseccional, pretende visibilizar las condiciones concretas en las que viven las mujeres y las disidencias sexo-genéricas en Latinoamérica, discutir sus múltiples estrategias de resistencia y sus contradiscursos para eludir los mecanismos de opresión específicos de la región, resultantes de una mezcla de fuerzas allí presentes.

**Shange, Savannah:** *Progressive Dystopia. Abolition, Antiblackness, and Schooling in San Francisco*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2019. 232 pp. ISBN 978-1-4780-0668-8. (pbk)

San Francisco is the endgame of gentrification, where racialized displacement means that the Black population of the city hovers at just over 3 percent. The Robeson Justice Academy opened to serve the few remaining low-income neighborhoods of the city, with the mission of offering liberatory, social justice themed education to youth of color. While it features a progressive curriculum including Frantz Fanon and Audre Lorde, the majority Latinx school also has the district's highest suspension rates for Black students. In “Progressive Dystopia” Savannah Shange explores the potential for reconciling the school's marginalization of Black students with its sincere pursuit of multiracial uplift and solidarity. Drawing on ethnographic fieldwork and six years of experience teaching at the school, Shange outlines how the school fails its students and the community because it operates within a space predicated on antiblackness. Seeing San Francisco as a social laboratory for how Black communities survive the end of their worlds, Shange argues for abolition over revolution or progressive reform as the needed path toward Black freedom.

*Aimee Meredith Cox:* By locating the everyday mechanisms of the neoliberal state in a progressive

school in San Francisco, Savannah Shange brings the lived experiences of social actors often only talked about as ‘Black and Brown bodies’ into discussions of the afterlife of slavery. And in so doing, she reveals the fissures in Afropessimism and critical anthropology. “Progressive Dystopia” is scholarship at its finest and an essential contribution.

**Meurer, Michaela:** *Curupira und Kohlenstoff. Eine praxistheoretische Revision Politischer Ontologie am Beispiel von Umweltschutz in Amazonien.* Bielefeld: transkript Verlag, 2021. 352 pp. ISBN 978-3-8376-5810-1. (pbk)

Für den Schutz der Amazonaswälder Brasiliens bieten die gemeindebasiert verwalteten Nutzreservate Resex großes Potential. Michaela Meurer befasst sich detailliert mit der Vielfalt von Nutzungsregeln in der Resex Tapajós-Arapiuns, die sich im Zuge der gemeinsamen Verwaltung durch Staat, Zivilgesellschaft und Lokalbevölkerung herausgebildet haben. Die facettenreiche Ethnographie vermittelt einen fundierten Einblick in soziale Realitäten des heutigen Amazoniens und erweitert die anthropologische Theoriebildung um eine praxistheoretische Ausgestaltung Politischer Ontologie.

**Wehrli, Angelica:** *Vanishing Rice Fields. The Quest for Wealth and Belief in (Post-)Socialist Vietnam.* Wien: Lit Verlag, 2021. 226 pp. ISBN 978-3-643-80368-9. (pbk)

Vanishing Rice Fields delineates how the quest for wealth and belief manifests itself in contemporary Vietnam. Based on multi-local and longitudinal ethnographic research, the author examines how wealth is pursued by household members and entrepreneurs. The quest for belief is brought into relief through inquiry into how norms and values have been re-evaluated, altered, subverted, or restored. Focusing on the taboo topic of female feticide, the study elucidates why some parents ultimately decide to commit feticide, and why others, especially entrepreneurs, refrain from it. The case of the entrepreneurs shows a possible way out of the “vicious circle” that leads to female feticide and perpetuates gender inequality.

**Lacbawan, Macario:** *Regimes of Contention. Resistance and the Governmentality of Resources in Indigenous Philippines.* Frankfurt/New York: Campus Verlag, 2021. 288 pp. ISBN 978-3-593-51376-8. (pbk)

This book is an anthropological reflection of the entanglement of political contention and shifting governmentalities on indigenous resources. Using historical ethnography as an epistemological tool, it illuminates how changing state regimes from the until the present moment in Philippine history impute distinct techniques of relationship to ancestral land and engender un-

stable subjectivities that indigenous peoples must embody as prerequisites to their access to resources. Conceptually, it brings together Charles Tilly’s theoretical reflection on social movements in direct conversation with Michel Foucault’s governmentality as conditions of political contention.

**Casimir, Michael J.:** *Floating Economics. The Cultural Ecology of the Dal Lake in Kashmir, India.* New York, Oxford: Berghahn, 2021. 362 pp. ISBN 978-1-80073-029-8. (hbk)

In the Himalayas of the Indian part of Kashmir three communities depend on the ecology of the Dal lake: market gardeners, houseboat owners and fishers. *Floating Economics* describes for the first time the complex intermeshing economy, social structure and ecology of the area against the background of history and the present volatile socio-political situation. Using a holistic and multidisciplinary approach, the author deals with the socioeconomic strategies of the communities whose livelihoods are embedded here and analyses the ecological condition of the Dal, and the reasons for its progressive degradation.

*Raminder Kaur:* A unique, erudite and engaging study of local lives on and around the Dal Lake in Kashmir away from the violence that we hear about so much in news channels before the military crackdown and blackout of 2019.

**Rofel, Lisa, and Sylvia J. Yanagisako:** *Fabricating Transnational Capitalism. A Collaborative Ethnography of Italian-Chinese Global Fashion.* Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2019. 392 pp. ISBN 978-1-4780-0045-7. (pbk)

In this innovative collaborative ethnography of Italian-Chinese ventures in the fashion industry, Lisa Rofel and Sylvia J. Yanagisako offer a new methodology for studying transnational capitalism. Drawing on their respective linguistic and regional areas of expertise, Rofel and Yanagisako show how different historical legacies of capital, labor, nation, and kinship are crucial in the formation of global capitalism. Focusing on how Italian fashion is manufactured, distributed, and marketed by Italian-Chinese ventures and how their relationships have been complicated by China’s emergence as a market for luxury goods, the authors illuminate the often-overlooked processes that produce transnational capitalism – including privatization, negotiation of labor value, rearrangement of accumulation, reconfiguration of kinship, and outsourcing of inequality. In so doing, “*Fabricating Transnational Capitalism*” reveals the crucial role of the state and the shifting power relations between nations in shaping the ideas and practices of the Italian and Chinese partners.

*Anna Lowenhaupt Tsing:* Across the reach of global capitalism, Italian managers and Chinese entrepreneurs cast sticky webs of desire toward each other. And yet,



as they negotiate the value of their respective labors, a quite different history of assessment and translation is brought into play for each. “Fabricating Transnational Capitalism” unpacks what global capital means on the ground. There are surprises: investment is kinship; private is state-run. For the ethnographic study of political economy, the book will become a classic.

**Alatas, Ismail Fajrie:** *What Is Religious Authority? Cultivating Islamic Communities in Indonesia*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2021. 256 pp. ISBN 978-0-691-20431-4. (pbk)

This compelling book draws on Ismail Fajrie Alatas’s unique insights as an anthropologist to provide a new understanding of Islamic religious authority, showing how religious leaders unite diverse aspects of life and contest differing Muslim perspectives to create distinctly Muslim communities.

Taking readers from the eighteenth century to today, Alatas traces the movements of Muslim saints and scholars from Yemen to Indonesia and looks at how they traversed complex cultural settings while opening new channels for the transmission of Islamic teachings. He describes the rise to prominence of Indonesia’s leading Sufi master, Habib Luthfi, and his rivalries with competing religious leaders, revealing why some Muslim voices become authoritative while others don’t. Alatas examines how Habib Luthfi has used the infrastructures of the Sufi order and the Indonesian state to build a durable religious community, while deploying genealogy and hagiography to present himself as a successor of the Prophet Muhammad.

Challenging prevailing conceptions of what it means to be Muslim, “What Is Religious Authority?” demonstrates how the concrete and sustained labors of translation, mobilization, collaboration, and competition are the very dynamics that give Islam its power and diversity.

*Webb Keane:* An extraordinary accomplishment. Alatas possesses a singular vision, informed by the historian’s deep sense of the past and the ethnographer’s nuanced insight into the present. He has accomplished a rare feat, doing justice to both the universal claims of prophecy and the thoroughly human struggle to realize them.

**Mennis, Mary R.:** *Voices of the Villagers. Madang and Motu People in Papua New Guinea (1)*. Glienicke: Galda Verlag, 2021. 237 pp. ISBN 978-3-96203-144-2. (pbk)

Mary Mennis taped the voices of village elders along the Madang coast in the 1970s. Topics included: origins of the tribes; traditional village life before outside contact; spiritual beliefs; weather magic; men’s houses and

initiations; and the customs of trading in triple-deck canoes along the coast using earthenware pots as collateral. It also covers the origins of their cargo cults which differ from the theory proposed by Peter Lawrence. Mary Mennis and her husband, Brian lived in Papua New Guinea for 20 years between 1962 and 1982. Brian, a surveyor, was posted to Madang for eight years beginning in 1971 when the centenary of Miklouho Maclay was being celebrated in Madang. After reading his accounts of the large trading canoes he saw in 1871, Mary became fascinated in the local culture. She discovered the people had stopped building these canoes during the war in the 1940s. She then encouraged 5 old men who still had the knowledge to build another canoe in 1978 and she documented its construction, the magic of the weather men; the pots they traded and the whole trading system. This knowledge was on the verge of being lost. Launching one of Mary’s earlier books, *Grand Chief Sir Michael Somare*, first Prime Minister of Papua New Guinea thanked her for her work and said the book “The Flagged History of Madang” would play a great role in educating the young people.

**Mennis, Mary R.:** *Voices of the Villagers. Madang and Motu People in Papua New Guinea (2)*. Glienicke: Galda Verlag, 2021. 378 pp. ISBN 978-3-96203-144-2. (pbk)

What were the villagers’ reactions to the outsiders who came to Madang? These are found in taped interviews in the 1970s from memories handed down from earlier generations. First was Miklouho Maclay who arrived in 1871. The people thought he was from the moon. In 1884 when Madang became a German Province, the villagers were forced to work on plantations and on clearing land. They wanted to return to their old ways of trading and having feasts. They revolted in 1904 and were harshly punished. During WW II the Japanese occupied Madang and again their way of life was affected. After the war the Australian Government was in charge until 1975 when Papua New Guinea became independent. In these pages we discover what the people thought about all these changes. Basically, they saw the Germans as the first bosses then they left and the Australians took over, then during the war the Japanese arrived and they were the new bosses. You had to do what they said, or you would be in trouble. The final part of Part 2 contains the memories of the *Motu* traders, the *hiri* trade and the large *lagatoi* canoes which carried pots to the Gulf in exchange for the much needed sago. These interviews were made in 1995, 50 years after the end of WW II. These two volumes “Voices of the Villagers” have preserved much knowledge of the history and culture of the Bel people of Madang and to a lesser extent that of the Motu people of Port Moresby.

Today it is so difficult to be stupid  
because the rivalry is gigantic.

## Review of Articles

(by Joachim G. Piepke, Darius Piwowarczyk, Stanisław Grodz, and Vincent Adi Gunawan)

**el-Sayed el-Aswad:** *Oriental Images and Ethics. British Empire and the Arab Gulf (1727–1971). A Perspective from Historical Anthropology.* *Anthropos* 116. 2021: 319–330.

Oriental images of the people of the Arabian Gulf created by British orientalists have been given less attention by scholars than the economic and political activities of the local and global actors in the region. Relying on historical material, the objective of this article is to explore the images and stereotypes created about the people of the Arabian Gulf before and after the establishment of the Trucial States, currently the United Arab Emirates (founded 1971), by notions of Orientalism and British colonialism two centuries ago. The roots of Orientalism can be traced back to the era of colonialism, which resulted in the fragmentation of nations and the rise of geopolitics based on economic interests. The role of Orientalism appeared in legitimizing empire building, constructing the European self and generating social hierarchy and cultural difference. Orientalism here refers to a Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient. The Orient in this paper refers mainly to Arab and/or Islam where images and symbols discussed here must be viewed as the product and condition of broader and intricate historical processes, including colonialism.

Written and printed words such as treaties, documents, ordinances, and laws, were used by British imperialists as effective tools in tightening their grip on the Gulf societies. Images, depictions, and names such as “Pirate Coast” and the “Trucial Coast”, not the “Arab Coast,” were created and imposed on the Arab Gulf communities by British orientalists and imperialists.

Oriental images of the Arabian Gulf region as “pirates,” a Eurocentric perspective contingent on historical mystification, were constructed in the late 18th and early 19th centuries by the British Empire and its creation of East India Company claiming that their ships were attacked by Arab tribesmen, particularly the Qawasim residing in Sharjah and Ras al-Khaimah. The imperial British subjugated the entire Gulf region by depicting Arabs as dangerous, bloodthirsty, and irrational pirates threatening peaceful and rational British traders. In the early 18th century, the British, after gaining enough military power to dominate all others, changed from overseas merchants and traders “into imperialist swashbucklers and largescale extortionists.” Reports and writings made by colonial administration officials, travelers, and writers such as Charles Belgrave (1966), George Curzon (1892), John Gordon Lorimer (1915), Samuel Barrett Miles (1919), Charles Rathbone Low (1877), and Arnold Wilson (1928), to mention a few, painted Arabian Gulf communities in negative terms. For instance, Charles Low (*History of the Indian Navy: 1613–1863*. London, 1877: 311) described the Arabs living in the Gulf as “maritime

robbers,” while Arnold Wilson, a former British civil commissioner, portrayed them as “pirates” and stated that, “Arab rule in the Gulf was for long periods synonymous with piracy” (*The Persian Gulf. An Historical Sketch from the Earliest Time to the Beginning of the Twentieth Century*. London, 1928: 11). Notably, many of these writers and commentators were associated with the British military or government, if not directly employed by them.

Louise Sweet criticized the conventional historical-oriental image of Arabian Gulf societies as “pirates” or organized “piratical” tribes. Sweet stated that social structures of these societies were not known to the scholars who made such unjustified statements. The people of Sahil, Oman (including the UAE) “had no quarrel with the British, in part, perhaps, because of the size and armed strength of their ships. But another factor can be suggested. As chiefs of polities and ports these men held offices superior in the local hierarchy in status to merchants, by Gulf tradition, and the British were as yet regarded as merchants” (*Pirates or Polities? Arab Societies of the Persian or Arabian Gulf, 18th Century*. *Ethnohistory* 11/3, 1964: 268).

There were three factors in the early nineteenth century that combined to draw the British into relations with the people of the Gulf. First, fights arising from trade rivalry and tribal/religious wars were endemic amongst Arab tribes, particularly the people of Oman (following Ibadi Islam or Ibādiyya) and the Qawasim of Ras al-Khaimah (Sunni Muslims), impacting British shipping. Second, a new politico-religious power of the Wahhabis (Sunni) had arisen in Arabia. The Wahhabis, under the Al Saud family, occupied most of eastern Arabia spreading to the Qawasim. Nevertheless, the British tended to portray the Qawasim, sea-based allies of the Wahhabis, as pirates. Thirdly, Napoleon’s ambition for a vast eastern empire threatened British’s interest in the East India Company. Fears of a French penetration of the Gulf as preliminary to penetration of India had meant that the Gulf had remained high on the security agendas of the home governments in London and of the governors of Bombay. Additionally, the Ottoman involvement in the Gulf formed a threat to the British.

During the nineteenth century (1820–1891), Britain began generating treaties with local tribes whereby, in exchange for the cessation of the so-called piracy and maritime war, Britain would recognize the ruling families and offer protection in return for a maritime truce, ironically viewed as the “benevolence of the British empire.” It is interesting to note that it is, in fact, quite often stated now and later that the continuance of the supposed Quasimi piracy was actually beneficial to British shipping in the Gulf, clearing the way for their exclusive domination.

The British government fashioned an image of itself as being the sole overlord and protector of the Gulf by

imposing the Exclusivity Treaty in 1892 according to which the shaikhs “pledged not to cede, sell or mortgage territory to any foreign power but Britain.” Britain thought of hegemony in terms of risk management rather than ethics. The shaikhs or rulers were forbidden from entering into agreement with powers other than Britain, a move that strengthened British influence over the states.

The historical material presented in this article displays that Great Britain went against its claimed standards of civilization (e.g., freedom and human rights) as a result of its imperialist and oppressive anti-Arab and anti-Muslim agenda. However, this research has shown that historical evidence from the Arabian Gulf presents a challenge to Orientalist and pro-imperialist images of the Arabian Gulf as involved in piracy, violence, or terrorism.

**Nogueira, Carlos:** José Saramago e George Steiner. A antropologia do mal ou “o mal é”. *Anthropos* 116.2021: 367–377.

O mal é o mais comum e o mais complexo dos problemas humanos. Ininterruptamente e, muitas vezes, de um modo avassalador, cada um de nós tem de lidar com o mal enquanto acontecimento, categoria de pensamento e palavra irreduzível a um significado estável. Este princípio da universalidade ôntica do mal aplica-se à Humanidade como um todo, aos impérios, às nações, aos grupos humanos, a cada pessoa. O mal é transversal a todos os atos, pensamentos e decisões, e o seu impacto pode ser medido em termos mais individuais (uma injúria, uma calúnia, um roubo) ou mais coletivos (escravatura, genocídios, Holocausto), e em termos mais ou menos extremos. Lei inexorável da existência individual e social, o mal é, num sentido lato, o sofrimento experimentado por seres sencientes (humanos e não humanos) e a imposição desse sofrimento por parte agentes conscientes dos seus atos (não se considera, para já, o mal natural, o mal trazido por fenómenos da Natureza como terremotos e pela condição mortal do homem: a doença, o envelhecimento, a morte. Esta última modalidade de mal pode ser designada de mal físico). O conceito de mal inclui tudo o que no mundo é prejudicial e destrutivo para o ser humano.

O mal é, segundo George Steiner, o “inumano”. Este adjetivo (ou substantivo adjetivado) atravessa toda a obra de Steiner, que o aplica às expressões mais violentas de “barbárie” (outro vocábulo que Steiner utiliza muito e é também sinónimo de mal): “O que é a nossa história, desde o assassinio de Caim até às câmaras de gás e à incineração nuclear, senão uma crónica sobre o inumano” (Fragmentos [um pouco queimados]. Lisboa, 2016: 35). O leitor familiarizado com a obra ensaística de George Steiner lembrar-se-á sem dificuldade que o sintagma “O mal é” consubstancia uma máxima e um título de uma das partes deste livro. O valor desta máxima está em “Ela não afirma[r] nada menos do que a realidade ontológica e substantiva do mal” (2016: 30). Steiner não se ocupa do mal que adjetivamos de, sim-

plesmente, errado” ou “imoral”, nem do mal natural. Este autor equaciona o mal extremo e catastrófico, o mal inumano provocado pela crueldade, pela intolerância e pela violência sem limites. É este o tipo de mal que a obra romanesca de José Saramago representa e comenta com génio. Mas, em Saramago, o mal como aquilo que é ou pode ser “meramente” errado ou questionável acompanha também a expressão do mal superlativo, e esta conjugação contribui decisivamente para a largueza e a acuidade da visão saramaguiana do mal. Na síntese da compreensão do mal entra a doutrina cristã da criação, da queda e da redenção, que, para Saramago, não é mais do que uma mistificação e um jugo imposto à consciência. Para se aproximar da visão saramaguiana sobre o mal, eis, mais uma vez, estas palavras do escritor: “Os homens trazem em si a crueldade” (José Saramago nas suas palavras. Alfragide, 2010: 164). Vê-se nestas palavras uma síntese (máxima) perfeita do entendimento do autor sobre o problema da natureza do mal, da sua origem e das suas manifestações, e das suas relações com o bem. Ele completa este juízo dizendo: “Não devemos esquecer-nos disso, devemos ter cuidado. É preciso defender a possibilidade de criar e defender esse espaço de consciência, de lucidez. Essa é a nossa pequenina esperança” (2010: 162).

O materialismo histórico de Saramago não é o canónico e conservador. “Memorial do Convento” (Porto 2016), afinal, diz-nos que a História não está cativa de leis imutáveis, que a Providência não preestabelece o destino humano nem nele interfere, que o futuro é criado pelas vontades humanas.

O paradoxo do mal feito (alegadamente) em nome do Bem é inaceitável, para Saramago, e tem de ser lembrado, debatido. Blimunda, Baltasar, o Padre Bartolomeu de Gusmão, Scarlatti mas também todos aqueles que construíram o Convento de Mafra ajudam-nos a procurar soluções e paliativos para os nossos males sociais e morais. Nestas personagens, o Saramago ficcionista e o Saramago político encontram-se e criam um programa cujos princípios são os do socialismo, no sentido mais elevado desta palavra, e da grande literatura.

**Ngozi Onukawa, Edith:** Leftwardness. An Aspect of Prohibitions in the Igbo Culture. *Anthropos* 116.2021: 379–384.

An aspect of the Igbo’s traditional ethics is the prohibition of leftwardness. In fact, the people, among other issues, seriously abjure leftwardness. Anything that either comes from or occurs in the left side of the parts of the body is considered negative and therefore unacceptable. They abhor being left-handed. They also reject giving, receiving, or greeting with the left hand. Aside from the physical rejection of leftwardness by abhorring the giving or receiving with the left hand, the Igbo also express their rejection through ominous signs, songs, proverbs, blessing of kola nut, defamatory euphemisms, and other culturally significant avenues. The rejection of leftwardness/left-handedness seems to

have been near universal in ancient times but has waned nowadays in many cultures as people have begun to realize that there are benefits associated with it.

**Ojione Ojeh, Chukwuemeka:** The Collection, Authentication, and Use of Oral Evidence in African History. *Anthropos* 116.2021: 385–391.

Only in the first half of the last century, about one and a half centuries after Hegel's polemic that Africa is no historical part of the World and that it has no movement or development to exhibit, the then Regius Professor of Modern History in Oxford, Hugh Trevor-Roper, re-enacted this view. Trevor-Roper postulated that "[p]erhaps in the future there will be some African history to teach. But at present, there is none; only the history of Europeans in Africa. The rest is darkness ... and darkness is not the subject of history." He contended that all that happened in precolonial Africa was no more than "the unrewarding gyrations of barbarous tribes."

This view had earlier been advanced by A.P. Newton who argued that pre-colonial Africa was for the most part non-literate and thus had no past. To him, "[h]istory ... only begins when men take to writing." While it is true that pre-colonial Africa may have lacked elaborate written sources of its past, it is also true that the early histories of Western societies themselves were reconstructed from non-written sources, especially oral evidence. Their historians had relied either on direct oral evidence or on materials that once were entirely oral. Early in the 5th century B.C., Herodotus, the "father of history," had used oral evidence in his study of both European and African (Egyptian) histories, thus showing the antiquity of oral data in World and African historiography. Again, his study of Egypt at this early period in history turns inside out the assertion that Africa was an irrelevant corner of the globe. On the contrary, the evidence is that Africa had been an integral part of the main, of the "oikoumene."

Again, when Thucydides wrote on the Peloponnesian war in which he personally took part for a short while, he largely depended on his personal experience and oral evidence collected from other participants and witnesses of the 27-year-war. Other Greek writers such as Xenophon, Polybius, etc. personally participated in the events they wrote about. Chroniclers of the Middle Ages like Bede, Gregory of Tours, Isidore of Seville, etc. wrote in pre-literate (European) societies using oral evidence. In the Islamic world, too, historians worked directly and indirectly with oral data as well as written sources. The use of oral evidence persisted so that only by the end of the seventeenth century it had become rare for historians in Europe to collect or consult oral data at all. One history should not be considered inferior to another because of its dependence on oral evidence. Oral evidence is as valid as any other when it is appreciated that historiography as an activity incorporates any form of historical enquiry, including that based on oral sources.

Historical enquiry deriving from oral evidence is oral historiography. Oral tradition and oral history are the two types of oral historiography. Though both terms have been interchangeably used, they differ in so far as the former is a genre of source and the latter an activity. Oral tradition connotes widely practiced or understood and commonly or universally known aspects of a people's culture handed down at least for a few generations. It includes the tradition and folklore among peoples on issues where there are no written histories. Oral history, on the other hand, is an enquiry into the recent past; making use of life histories or personal recollections with the informant speaking on personal experience. It is the recollection of a participant in an event as elicited and tape-recorded by the researcher.

This article focuses on aspects of the collection of oral evidence which would guide the researcher in the direct face-to-face contact with the informant in the process of data collection. In this regard, we start by pointing out the need for the researcher to familiarize with the informant so as to gain the "friendship" and confidence of the latter from whom such historical evidence is to be derived. The need for confidence and trust which may be built in the course of interaction is to be respected before any meaningful investigation can begin.

Another principle in the collection of oral evidence for historical reconstruction is the principle of patience. The factor of patience is pertinent in so far as eliciting the required information is largely dependent on the willingness and co-operation of the informant who must be allowed to tell his story his own way, even if embellished or irrelevant. Apart from patience in the early/preliminary stages of his work, the researcher requires patience in the actual recording of the evidence so elicited.

Another factor, closely associated with patience, is the researcher's understanding of the nature and limitations of the evidence at his disposal. By all means, the investigator must avoid leading questions because, as said earlier, the informant must be allowed to tell his story in his own way. This does not, however, preclude the researcher showing some of his knowledge of the period or subject by contributing or guiding along certain lines. This would not only encourage the informant to speak out more freely but would caution him against distortions.

By its nature, oral evidence has inherent problems in its use of African history; one of the greatest if not the greatest of which is authenticity. No wonder it has been variously criticized. Oral evidence is susceptible to the charge of authenticity in that the way the evidence of one scholar is used is not verifiable by another. Therefore, for it to be veritable in African historiography, data from oral evidence need to be independently authenticated. The various ways of independent data authentication examined in this article are challenged by some major criticisms and problems inherent in the use of the data. First, a major criticism leveled against oral evidence is the distortion of facts. The influential anthropologist Robert Lowie could not attach

any value whatsoever to oral traditions because they could not be known to be true, while, according to moral philosopher Adam Ferguson, oral sources may at first have contained “some resemblance of truth” but still “vary with the imagination of those by whom they are transmitted, and in every generation receive a different form (either by accident or intentionally).” The historian is thus faced with the problem of imperceptible changes in oral evidence as time passes.

One of the causes of inadvertent distortion in the process of transmission is failure of memory because there can be omissions, confusion and indirect explanatory interpolations. Imagination reconstitutes (the past) not as it was but as a defective memory. But forgetting things is normal and is not characteristic of oral evidence alone. We can also experience loss of memory with written data that we previously knew, so that we have to peep into the books for prompting. However, the oral societies of Africa had devised strategies for such promptings in the absence of written sources. One such strategy is the use of mnemonic devices such as repetitions, poetic rhythms, etc., which served as preservatives of oral evidence regarding traditions of origin, list of past kings, etc.

A way of summing up, therefore, is to echo the postulation which emphasizes the interdisciplinary approach in the study of African history where evidence from other sources such as written evidence, scientific finds of archaeology, anthropology, etc. are used to provide a useful perspective in which to set oral evidence. This was what Herodotus did, and it has remained useful and fruitful in the reconstruction of African history. In this light, it behooves all historians to collect all the oral histories of their immediate localities and preserve them in writing before they are lost eternally. Caution, however, demands a selective adoption of oral materials following an intelligent scrutiny.

**Bilinović Rajačić, Ana, and Marko Škorić:** Virgin Birth Controversy. Study in the Anthropology of Ignorance. *Anthropos* 116.2021: 405–418.

The virgin birth controversy was initiated by the publishing of Spencer’s and Gillen’s book (*The Northern Tribes of Central Australia*. London, 1899), which was the first work to ever mention the existence of Aboriginal tribes whose members did not possess knowledge about the relationship between copulation and pregnancy. This discovery was inspired by the first volume of Hartland’s work (*Legend of Perseus. A Study of Tradition in Story, Custom, and Belief*. New York, 1894), in which he suggests that the story about supernatural birth probably originates from the period when the physical bond between a father and a child was inadequately understood or not understood at all. Later on, in 1903, Edmund Roth published the first independent confirmation of existence of a similar form of ignorance in the tribe of Tully River Blacks (*North Queensland Ethnography*, Bulletin No. 5. Brisbane,

1903). This work would later play a major role in the commencing of the second wave of the debate.

Malinowski insisted on understanding kinship as a set of physiological, psychological, and sociological processes and believed that as such, it needs to be understood in relation to the total cultural context. More precisely, he claimed that the physiological facts do not have a direct deterministic influence on kinship and parenthood, but that they are formed by the particular cultural conceptualization. According to the Trobrianders’ belief, when a person dies, the spirit of that person moves on to the island of Tuma, where it continues to live among the other ancestral spirits called *baloma*. Tuma is a place where, through the process of reincarnation, all human life comes into existence. In the form of a “spirit-child,” *baloma* reaches the mother’s womb. According to this belief about conception, these rejuvenated spirits, these little pre-incarnated babies or spirit-children, are the only source from which humanity draws its new supplies of life. He also noted that the Trobrianders possess detailed knowledge about human and animal anatomy, but do not possess knowledge about the functioning of some of the most important organs. In this context, he highlights that they are not familiar with the physiological function of the testes, nor do they have a word for ovaries.

Malinowski’s findings about the Trobrianders’ ignorance about physiological paternity were further weakened by the publishing of a paper by Rentoul (1931), a colonial administrator of the Trobriand Islands in the region of Lousia. Rentoul’s personal contact with the Trobrianders left him certain that Malinowski’s claims were not true, as well as that the Trobrianders were familiar with the basic facts about physiological paternity. In order to support this claim, Rentoul mentioned cases of Trobriand fathers convicted of adultery, who suffered through their struggle for custody over their sons, after the mother, in accordance with the customs that apply to this situation, stated the intention to return to her original family together with the children.

The debate on the subject of (a lack of) knowledge about physiological paternity reached its heated peak in the mid-1960s, especially between Edmund Leach and Melford Spiro. In his work about Frazer’s contribution to anthropology, Leach expressed harsh criticism, with particular emphasis on Spiro’s misinterpretation of the passage on the ignorance of natives about the true causes of pregnancy. Leach (1966) further directly condemned all anthropologists who believed in the complete ignorance about physiological paternity among the Australian Aborigines and the Trobrianders, accusing them of racism.

Leach (1966) was particularly interested in the possibility of comparing beliefs about virgin birth among the Australians and the Trobrianders with the dogma about the virgin birth of Jesus Christ. The possibility of such a comparison was actually at the heart of this theoretical debate. Arguments proposed by Leach and Spiro referred to the answers to the following questions: a) how should one compare systems of beliefs about vir-

gin birth that exist in different cultures (e.g., Trobriand and Australian on the one hand and Christian on the other) and b) whether the meaning of such beliefs is literal or metaphorical. Leach believed that these belief systems were comparable and metaphorical, while Spiro claimed that they were incomparable and literal. Leach criticized the idea that dogmatic claims, in their inception, were unsuccessful attempts to explain the causes and effects in the world of nature and emphasized that it is necessary to ascertain if there is anything which a dogma of Virgin Birth 'says' about the society in which it is affirmed.

One theory believes that the relationship between sex and pregnancy, that is, birth, was realized only after the domestication of animals, which means, around 10,000 to 12,000 years ago. That is also when the transition to sedentism, urbanism, and domestication occurred, as well as the change in the attitude towards the ancestors, the role of the man, monogamy, children, privacy, property, etc.

**Piowarczyk, Darius J.:** Je näher, desto ähnlicher. Ein koloniales Klischee, das räumliche Entfernung in kulturellen Termini interpretierte. *Anthropos* 116.2021: 419–428.

The article concerns the perception of indigenous peoples by European and US-American carriers of the colonial project (missionaries, administrators, military theoreticians, etc.) at the turn of the 19th and 20th centuries. This perception reflected, in the first place, the ethnocentric component that had been present in every culture even before cultural relativism put it in question. In the course of the 19th century, it also received "scientific" legitimation in the form of Cultural Darwinism, represented, inter alia, by Lewis H. Morgan who conceptualized cultural evolution as going through three stages: savagery – barbarism – civilization. Here, the author analyzes the spatial dimension of the Morganian triad, namely the increasingly negative perception of the local population by colonial agents in relation to the growing distance from centers of colonial power.

**Dulin, John:** Charismatic Christianity's Hard Cultural Forms and the Local Patterning of the Divine Voice in Ghana. *American Anthropologist* 123/1.2021: 108–119.

"The data for this article were gathered as part of the Mind and Spirit Project, a Templeton-funded, Stanford-based comparative and interdisciplinary project under the direction of T. M. Luhrmann. [...] The big question driving the Mind and Spirit Project is: Does culture change experience? For anthropologists, the claim that culture changes experience is uncontroversial, but the project seeks to explore this question with a wider interdisciplinary audience. My aim in this article is narrower than that of the project as a whole. I seek to disentangle

global and local influences on culturally constituted experience. To tease out different streams of influence, I compare Charismatic Christian accounts of spiritual experience with the accounts of their reputed enemies in spiritual warfare: the "fetish priests" (*okomfo*), or those who marshal the aid of local deities to solve problems and exercise otherworldly power. In the Ghanaian census and the vernacular, the community of indigenous priests, priestesses, and their helpers are referred to as 'Traditionalists.' I treat Traditionalists and Charismatic Christians as coeval communities (Fabian 2014) with different degrees of immersion within Charismatic Christian cultural forms" (pp. 109–110).

The question "Has God (or a god) spoken to your mind, through a thought he has placed in your mind?" was put to twenty-one urban Charismatic Christians and twenty Traditionalists. The author focuses on how they described their experience in response to it.

Examining the impact culture makes on human experience, the author pointed out that the responses of both Charismatic Christians and Traditionalists indicated that since hierarchy was central to social relations of both groups (the feature present in their overlapping, partially connected lifeworld), it impacted the way both communities experienced the divine as someone who is in command and whom one cannot resist. He further pointed out that members of both groups shared pre-theoretical assumptions about the mind, senses, and the body as being 'bundled together', i.e., having no clearly defined borders. This "distinguishes Ghanaian concepts of person from more dualistic models that are common in places like North America and Europe" (p. 115).

"Overall, the interviews suggest that Traditionalists, compared to Charismatics, give little attention to the mental realm as a site of supernatural communication and focus mostly on sensory experience, on seeing with eyes and hearing with ears. This inattention to the mental as an autonomous realm of experience can be seen in ethnography that notes a distinctive body focus in some communities in Ghana" (p. 116).

"We hired Dufie [a Charismatic Christian with a bachelor's degree in political science] to give short versions of our main interview to people on the street. This short interview asked people if God has spoken to them in a way they could 'hear with their ears.' If they said 'yes,' the interviewer asked follow-up questions like 'Did you feel as if the voice was outside your head?' Other questions asked respondents if God had ever spoken to them with a clearly nonauditory mental voice, such as the following: 'Some people say that God speaks to them in their minds, with a distinct voice in their minds, but not an audible voice. Does that happen to you?' This question, along with other probes, increased Dufie's exposure to a framework that emphasizes the distinction between mental and sensory experience. Over the period Dufie worked for us, she started paying more attention to the distinction between hearing God speak with the mind and the ears. When we first met, she claimed that she heard God's voice with her ears every day. However, after a few months of conducting these interviews on a daily basis, she

came to realize that God actually speaks to her mind, that God's voice is inside her head. According to Dufie, the interview oriented her to attend to the distinction between her thoughts and senses in a new way, and that changed how she understood her experience" (p. 117).

**Otiono, Nduka:** Dream Delayed or Dream Betrayed: Politics, Youth Agency and the Mobile Revolution in Africa. *Canadian Journal of African Studies / La Revue canadienne des études africaines* 55/1.2021: 121–140.

Abstract: "The 'mobile revolution' in Africa celebrates mobile telephony as reconfiguring political mobilization and transforming individual and collective political agency. Beyond politics, scholars tend to focus on the critical role of mobile phones in economic advancement in Africa. Less consideration has been given to the use of technology by governments to control civil and political dissent, and the complex nature of 'slacktivism,' 'clicktivism' or 'armchair activism' impacting African youth agency. This paper examines disenfranchised African youths' complicated adaptation of digital technology for political mobilization against parallel repression by governments. I use as case studies the fall of President Yahya Jammeh of The Gambia and President Robert Mugabe of Zimbabwe."

**Trapido, Joe:** "Masterless Men": Riots, Patronage, and the Politics of the Surplus Population in Kinshasa. *Current Anthropology* 62/2.2021: 198–217 (the article: 198–208; comments from six scholars: 209–214; the author's reply: 214–216).

"[W]hile we should recognize the distinctively modern outlines of political space in Kinshasa, Western understandings of politics do contain assumptions that we need to set aside. Examples include the assumption that political equality can (and should) exist in the absence of economic equality (see Staeheli and Mitchell 2008) or that politics is essentially about speech and communication, rather than, say, occupation of space or distribution (see also Meiksins-Wood 1995; Vasudevan 2015). As we will see, these assumptions are fundamentally at odds with the political conceptions of Kinshasa's poor majority.

Another of these assumptions, derived from modern European political theory but common in anthropology (Radcliffe-Brown 1940: xiv; Sahlins 2017 [1972]: 134–167), is that politics is based in some form of underlying 'contract' between 'rulers' and 'the people' (for critiques, see Gledhill 2000:10–11). Despite great differences, contemporary Africanist political theory shares with classic social contract theory the idea that there is a long-term bargain between leaders and followers. Distribution is central to this bargain, with African politics supposedly characterized by 'vertical' (from high to low rather than class based) forms of resource distribution and political allegiance. One strand within this thinking links distribution to legitimacy: the

leader as 'good giver' creates both material incentives and a system of ideas (Bayart 1993; Bratton and Van de Walle 1994). In all versions of this story, the bargain is pathological because vertical distribution dissipates accumulation, glorifies 'corruption,' and prevents the formation of a Weberian bureaucracy (Bayart 1993; Chabal and Daloz 1999; de Sardan 1999). Recent Africanist anthropology has both endorsed and nuanced this picture, pointing to the ambiguities of patrimonialism: showing how the demos can both critique and legitimate practices of patronage or corruption, relying on brokers while decrying or satirizing the moral malaise (de Sardan 1999; Smith 2006).

Yet valuable as they are in the details, such stories paint a misleading portrait of African political economy. Massive capital flight relative to GDP – higher in Africa than in other continents (Collier, Hoeffler, and Pattillo 2001) – is incompatible with the notion that elite pillage is linked to exceptional pressures to redistribute vertically. Money stashed in the Virgin Islands has, by definition, resisted the pull of local retinues (Trapido 2015). This essay complements this macro-perspective, demonstrating ethnographically that the focus on the bargain secured via vertical distribution is misplaced.

This is not to deny the importance of either resources or ideas in politics. As elsewhere in the world, resources and distribution are inseparable from ideological affiliation. But looking closely at different kinds of political payment actually undertaken, we see clear categorical differences. That is to say, we see differences between horizontal payments to class equals and vertical payments to social inferiors. As I will show, continuing to 'rule' in Kinshasa depends not on striking a bargain with the demos but on pleasing other powerful people, and the overwhelming majority of distributions are directed either horizontally or upward to other power brokers. The tiny sums paid to poor people to stage demonstrations buy no wider support; indeed, they probably alienate a hostile populace further, and even those who take part are rarely won over. An important question for this essay, therefore, is, what is everyone doing? Why do the ruling classes pay the poor to participate when they are not prepared to invest enough to win real popular support? Why do the poor turn up for politicians whom they mostly despise? How do the riot and the paid-for demonstration overlap? I suggest that it is in the politics of presence and in struggles over space and circulation that we should start to look for the answer" (p. 201).

**Van der Geest, Sjaak:** Vanity in Anthropology. About the Art of Showing through Non-Showing. *Etnofoor* 33/1.2021: 91–105.

The author takes a book by his erstwhile PhD supervisor and friend André Köbben about the role of vanity in science as a starting point and constant reference in this essay. He admits: "I liked the point he was raising: vanity as a driving force in science, including anthro-

pology, a phenomenon that everyone could probably recognise but preferred to keep silent about” (p. 91).

“A glance at the varied meanings and connotations of vanity shows that it has overwhelmingly been condemned and viewed as a prelude to tragedy. [...] One of the proverbs in the Old Testament is probably the best known statement about the foolishness of vanity: ‘Pride goes before destruction, a haughty spirit before a fall’ (Proverbs 16:18). Thomas Aquinas would probably have agreed with the more laical definition of vanity by the Oxford English Dictionary as ‘the excessive belief in one’s own abilities or attractiveness to others’, or that by the Dutch dictionary Van Dale that mentions two meanings: ‘too high an opinion of one’s own excellence’ and ‘the desire to be admired and praised by others’. A Dutch synonym of vanity (usually translated as *ijdelheid*) is *verwaandheid*, which literally means ‘having a delusion/being deluded’. These two characteristics, self-centredness and being misled, go together in the concept of vanity, but the overriding qualification is one of moral disapproval” (p. 92).

“The contemporary Dutch philosopher Frank Meester (2010) thinks, however, that vanity is an underestimated virtue. I read his treatise, but the blurb on the cover of his book summarises his view on vanity best: ‘Without the urge to be special, we dwell in the shadow of anonymity and would never reach immortality. There would be no art, literature, top sports or science. Without vanity we would be nothing, because we are simply not much more than the stories others tell about us’ (my translation). Does this provocative reversal of the appreciation of vanity’s contribution to human creativity reflect what moves present-day scientists, including anthropologists, to ostentatiously promote their own work in publications and e-mails, at conferences and on websites?

An anthropology of vanity? The call for papers for this issue of *Etnofoor* invites authors ‘to reflect on the role of vanity in the multiple social worlds that ethnographers inhabit’. My thoughts went to my many years of fieldwork in a rural Ghanaian community. Did I ever discuss concepts like pride (*ahantan*, *ahokyere*) or vanity (*ahuhude*, *ahuhusem*) with the people in the town? In fact, I did not even know the latter two terms. When someone acted arrogantly or pompously, people disapprovingly said (and I did as well): *akyere ne ho* (literally he/she shows him-/herself). A common proverb was my favourite way of jokingly criticising someone’s self-satisfaction: *nkyene nkamfo ne ho* (salt does not praise itself); an approximate equivalent to the meaning and feeling of the Dutch expression *eigen roem stinkt* (self-praise stinks). The Dutch expression beautifully articulates that self-praise is counterproductive and reminds us of the biblical proverb that pride comes before a fall. Therefore, if you are complacent and proud, you should avoid showing this openly and rather find a way to make others praise you. Vanity only works if you are able to hide it and at the same time seduce others to express their admiration for you” (p. 93).

“For Köbben, Bax provides a clear example of anthropology being harmed by vanity; by his desire to

publish ‘exciting’ data that would attract colleagues and reap admiration. His vanity not only drove him to embellish his ethnographic work unduly, but also to increase its quantity; his list of publications contained some titles that did not even exist and some that were heavily self-plagiarised (Van Kolschooten 2012: 190–202; Köbben 2017: 55–61). Admiration from colleagues was more important to Bax than anthropology, Köbben concludes” (p. 94).

“Elias’s complacency does not detract from the inspiration he provided to a large number of sociologists and anthropologists. Nor should the many debates and disputes about Elias’s grand theory of civilisation and configuration be seen as signs that he misled science. [...] But, according to Köbben, Elias did inflict some ‘limited damage’ by refusing to respond to critical comments about his work. His ‘excessive belief’ in his own excellence and always being right prevented the type of debate that science – including anthropology – needs in order to progress. The critique by anthropologists of his over-generalised (and according to some, ethnocentric) concept of civilisation is a case in point (see also Thoden van Velzen 1982).

Another – intriguing – observation from Köbben is that most of the authors he criticises are brilliant writers. It is not only vanity that beats science, but aesthetics too. One could say that the beauty of the text is part of the authors’ vanity. Köbben’s praise regarding writing style applies to both Bax and Elias, and most of all to the third ‘anthropologist’ on his list, megastar Claude Lévi-Strauss.

Lévi-Strauss, like Elias, is criticised for his self-righteousness and the fact that he did not deign to respond to serious criticism of his work. Köbben provides a list of some solid criticisms of Lévi-Strauss’s work (Homans and Schneider 1955; Aspelin 1975; Revel 1962; Korn 1973), which never received any serious reaction” (p. 95).

Then in the section called “Digital seducers”, the author draws attention to “modern technological, mainly digital, phenomena that have had a tremendous impact on vanity in academia.” He briefly discusses practices of ResearchGate, Google Scholar, creating pages about oneself on platforms such as Wikipedia, and adds warnings against ‘fake’ publishers and ‘predatory conferences’. The author makes it, however, clear that apart from dubious practices, the new phenomena bring also advantages in the form of facilitating contacts with other scholars, quicker ways of acquiring information and access to sources. He ends his essay on the following note:

“This brings me to another aspect of shifting mores in vanity and *Fremdzwang* [external constraint]: the precarity of today’s academic labour market contributes to a need for young academics to make themselves visible. The circumstances, one could say, force ‘vanity’ onto them. Vanity brought about through external pressures seems no longer ‘vain’. The philosopher Frank Meester, whom I mentioned earlier, seems to me a product of this change in the academic world.



Vanity in science? Yes! And we see it all around us and within ourselves. Personal websites and whipped-up CVs, self-written entries on Wikipedia, publication lists in Google Scholar, ResearchGate, and Academia, the proliferation of dubious open access journals, and so on; they are all expressions and drivers of our vanity. But without that vanity – and Frank Meester may be right about this – we would not be noticed and we would not get the job that we want. Vanity is a driving force of the scientific multinational company. Or am I going too far in my own vanity to write an essay with print screens referring directly or obliquely to my own work in anthropology? Be that as it may, it is time to take to heart the playful rebuke of an emeritus professor such as Köbben. We need a larger and more profound self-reflective exploration of the role of vanity in our production of anthropological and ethnographic accounts. And to return to Köbben, we should be more attentive to the boundary between useful and harmful vanity. Where is the tipping point that the Austrian writer Marie von Ebner-Eschenbach referred to when she wrote: *Wo die Eitelkeit anfängt, hört der Verstand auf* (Where vanity begins, reason ends)? And how seriously should we take Arthur Schopenhauer's (2004 [1818]) warning that the importance of truth should not give way to the importance of vanity and pride?" (p. 101).

**Kim, Kirsteen:** Racism Awareness in Mission: Touchstone or Cultural Blind Spot? *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 45/4.2021: 376–386.

“The term ‘racism’ came into common use in the context of the Black civil rights movement. The French-Tunisian-Jewish writer Albert Memmi defined it as ‘a generalizing definition and valuation of [biological] differences [between people], whether real or imaginary, to the advantage of the one defining and deploying them, and to the detriment of the one subjected to that act of definition, whose purpose is to justify (social or physical) hostility and assault.’ He added that ‘racism has a function. It is both the emblem and the rationalization for a system of social oppression’ ‘in defense of a real or potential benefit’ for the oppressor. Racism involves a ‘self-deception’ that one is essentially superior to others. It is a collective culture or discourse that absolutizes one’s own people and generalizes about others. So, the flip side of modern racism is White supremacy, which is integral to it.

The Dutch missiologist Johannes Hoekendijk was one of the chief critics of the *völkisch* approach in mission, which segregated communities. His formulation of *missio Dei* focused on common humanity and the-world-as-a-whole rather than on its differentiation into cultures. Such support for a humanization approach in mission that encompassed development and nation-building was dominant in ecumenical mission in the 1960s. As a movement initiated by the churches of the colonizers, the ecumenical movement was now impacted by the postcolonial thinking on culture and race

of the formerly colonized and missionized, who now rose to leadership in it. For Philip Potter, who was from the Caribbean and who was secretary of the Commission on World Mission and Evangelism (the IMC’s successor body with the WCC), mission was evangelizing those who ‘vaunt their Christian heritage but deny by their attitudes and acts the very heart of the gospel” (p. 380).

“If we need to classify people, which is hard to avoid in world mission, the use of culture is an improvement on the use of race insofar as culture is not genetically defined. And if cultures are not ranked, since culture is learned rather than innate, no single culture is absolute, and all are appreciated in the worldwide body of Christ. However, cultural anthropology as appropriated by missiology has not always kept up with the challenges of postcolonial perspectives. [...]

Much of the use of culture in evangelical missiology regards cultures as a given, and some of it is almost determinist – so, for example, when the emphasis is on contextualizing the gospel into a presumed pre-existing tradition defining a discrete group of people. In such cases, culture inherits the rigidity of race. Furthermore, in common parlance, cultures are ranked, and there are many for whom European culture retains an absolute value. So, although attention to culture in the postwar period has mitigated the abuses of racism and at its best encouraged people from different backgrounds and communities to appreciate one another, I affirm Stanley’s warning that the contemporary use of ‘culture’ in mission (at least evangelical mission), like ‘race’ a century ago, tends to anthropological essentialism” (pp. 381–382).

“There are a number of reasons for the lack of attention to race in contemporary missiology, none of which excuses it, and each of which could suggest ways to bring out racism as a missiological problem. The first is what I have called in the title of this article a ‘cultural blind spot.’ [...] if racism is an unspoken problem, the discourse of ‘culture’ may blind us to it; it may cover up what is racism by using culture euphemistically. Second reason for the invisibility of race as an issue is that the prevailing historical framework in missiology that divides the church and mission history into successive eras, or paradigms, gives the impression that the colonial era in which racialism was dominant is now past. [...]

A third reason for lack of consideration of race in contemporary missiology is the White supremacy in theology in general. [...]

Fourth, African American and Black Church perspectives that might expose racism in Western missiology are not often represented in the discipline. [...]

Finally, having examined the problem, where should mission and missiology go from here? In view of the evidence of racism in mission, I urge that at the very least racism awareness should be integral to mission education and even a touchstone for authentic missiology. Second, we should examine the use of ‘culture’ in missiology. [...] Third, the link between colonialism and contemporary racism needs to be made explicit in

missiology. [...] Fourth, mission theology should be interrogated for White supremacist thinking. One way to expose the latter is to read the scholarship of people of color. ‘Mission from the margins’ can be a way of saying that those of us who have been evangelizing others need to listen to the missionized and be open to being evangelized by them. Individuals and communities who have received mission claim space in missiology to speak for themselves and to speak back to those who preached to them. Wherever possible, White missiologists should not generalize about Christians of other regions and communities but hear and promote their views.

Lastly, it is not enough to be aware of racism. Just as liberation theologians argued that not opting for the poor was to support the existing injustices, so not to actively work against racism is to let it go unchecked. Antiracism and its corollary of denouncing White supremacy should be the natural stance of disciples of Jesus, who was despised by the Romans as a Jew and by the Jewish leaders in Jerusalem as a Galilean, and who uplifted members of other despised communities around him – Samaritans, Canaanites, Gerasenes, Gentile women, and so on. Racism and supremacy have no place in the kingdom of God or in the life of the Spirit” (pp. 382–383).

**Greenleaf, Maron:** Beneficiaries of Forest Carbon. Precarious Inclusion in the Brazilian Amazon. *American Anthropologist* 123/2.2021: 305–317.

Sustainable development projects and progressive politics of all kinds emphasize inclusion. Sometimes inclusion is meant to occur through giving benefits to poorer people, who are then *governed* as “beneficiaries.” But what does it mean to be a beneficiary? The author examines this question through analyzing climate-motivated forest-protection efforts in the Amazonian state of Acre, Brazil, that distribute benefits to poorer smallholders. This environmentally premised redistribution connects beneficiaries to the state, engendering a form of benefits-based citizenship and *everyday* spaces for negotiating its meaning. Whereas the state positions the beneficiary as a temporary status, beneficiaries envision it as a long-term relationship based on an exchange: state benefits *given* in exchange for them forgoing deforestation. Some beneficiaries use their new inclusion to assert this mutual dependence and claim more from the state. The increase in Amazonian deforestation threatens forest beneficiaries’ already precarious inclusion.

The author develops her argument in the following way. Environmental and development projects and progressive politics promote people’s inclusion through giving benefits to them. In places like the Amazon, the forest’s new value can financially and discursively support such benefits, with rural people being governed as forest beneficiaries. What it meant to be a forest beneficiary in Acre was not predetermined, however, and rural producers

sought to define it differently than state representatives and functionaries. In the everyday spaces of benefit distribution, such as the meetings analyzed in this article, they negotiated for more benefits and continuing relationships with the state in the face of inconsistent, inadequate, and temporary benefits and the risks they posed. As some farmers put it after praising the government benefits they had received, “more would be better.” For beneficiaries, forest benefits were not given in isolation. Rather, these benefits were understood as part of an exchange meant to forge reciprocal, lasting, and personal relationships. Forest benefits could thus enable a sense of being part of the political process, perhaps for the first time, and some measure of material inclusion, as precarious as it might be. Precarity can include this sense of possibility. Becoming a beneficiary could thus constitute a form of citizenship, a basis to engage politically for rural people for whom the state had been largely absent. The particularistic work of claiming benefits was different from that of claiming universal rights, often assumed to be the proper politics of democratic citizenship. Benefit distribution could work through personalized political relations, sometimes condemned as patronage. Yet, as some authors argue in the context of southern Africa, where social assistance looms so large in the state-citizen relationship, the state may will appear to the citizen not principally as a protector of equal rights, but as a material benefactor or even patron. Neoliberalism has undermined welfare-state social programs.

**Rosenswig, Robert M.:** Reconstructing Sovereignty on Ancient Mesoamerica’s Southern Pacific Coast. *American Anthropologist* 123/2.2021: 370–388.

Kingdoms from across the globe and through the ages show a surprising degree of consistency in their spacing and organization. I have argued that one day’s travel by foot (about 60 km) provides a structural limit for direct political control and defines a 30 km rule for the minimal spacing between sovereign polities. Examples from the Classic period Maya of Mesoamerica, the Syro-Anatolian Iron Age, and Medieval Europe all demonstrate similar spatial organization. Yes, Imperial Rome and Post-classic Teochtitlan were bigger and operated at a larger scale, but each was one of a relatively limited handful of imperial exceptions that prove the 30 km rule for the rest of the world’s hierarchically organized polities.

Many archaeologists undertheorize sovereignty by only implicitly inferring the sovereign status of the polities they study. Sovereignty also remains insufficiently operationalized in terms of its material remains, especially for those ancient societies without written accounts. During the final centuries before the Common Era, a network of kingdoms existed along the Pacific coast of Mexico, Guatemala, and El Salvador. Large earthen mounds that formed plazas lined with

stelae, elaborately carved in a shared art style, defined each kingdom's capital city. Izapa was the largest of these kingdoms, and recent LIDAR (light detection and ranging) and pedestrian surveys document the entire territory encompassing dozens of political centers. These data reveal an integrated three-tiered political hierarchy within the kingdom with the largest centers arranged defensively around the perimeter of Izapa's territory. Further, the "30 km rule" is defined as a cross-cultural pattern for the spacing of sovereign polities and confirmed based on the location of Izapa and neighboring Pacific coast kingdoms. The record of millennia of hierarchically organized human pluralities generates a more complete, comparative understanding of how sovereignty was established and how it functions.

A kingdom is defined here as a sovereign and regionally organized hierarchical polity ruled by a king. This label avoids the typological issue of whether Izapa and other sovereign polities around the world were complex chiefdoms, archaic states, micro-states, or city-states. Whatever label we apply, exploitation of the labor of the masses to support a small elite is a fundamental transformation of the social, political, and economic organization of human society. Izapa was a kingdom because a series of kings ruled over lesser elites who controlled dozens of lower-order political centers. All monumental centers within the Izapa kingdom (forty-one of which are documented) were organized with the same orientation and architectural features. The architectural and cosmological realms were centered in the local physical geography that reinforced the authority of the kingdom's elite, and the polity's monumental centers formed a tightly integrated settlement hierarchy. The Izapa kingdom's territory was arranged to maintain internal cohesion and external sovereignty. The capital city reached its apogee during the Guillen phase (300–100 BC), when new plazas were constructed and most of the site's stelae were erected. These stone monuments gave novel form to publicly recognized social norms and, among other things, depicted state-sanctioned violence. The Izapa capital's location on the edge of the piedmont facilitated travel downriver to lower-order centers. This location also receives much more rain than the coast and has always been an important environment to grow cacao, the most common form of Mesoamerican money and unit of account for taxation in subsequent centuries. Large secondary centers were arranged around the perimeter of the Izapa kingdom, which protected the inhabitants of smaller sites and established clear borders. All centers in the Izapa polity were arranged and oriented according to the same principles. This contrasts with the neighboring kingdoms, which had their own principles of site organization. A clear indication of the sovereignty of these kingdoms along the Pacific coast was their spacing beyond the expectations of the 30 km rule.

**Lee, Christine:** „You don't look American.“ Race and Whiteness in the Ethnographic and Disciplinary Encounter. *American Ethnologist* 48/2.2021; pp. 206–217.

According to some recent analyses, the ethnographic encounter takes place between a complicit, colonialist, white discipline and "natives" who are colonized and implicitly nonwhite. But by insisting that anthropology is an inherently white discipline, such binary frameworks ultimately recenter Westernness and whiteness, reinforcing the centrality of Western and white anthropology. In doing so, they conflate phenotypic and structural whiteness, flatten out how anthropological whiteness compels nonwhite bodies to adopt a white habitus, and obfuscate the shifting, unstable role played by phenotype in this process. For anthropologists of color, even those born and trained in the West, the whiteness of anthropology is variable, context-dependent, and unevenly distributed. This is illustrated with vignettes from ethnographic work in Peru, a country where racialization has typically been framed in terms of a white-indigenous binary, and as operating like class rather than determined through descent or phenotype.

Anthropology's long-standing and complicated relationship with colonial and imperial endeavors is widely recognized and discussed. After all, the long and violent history of racial oppression is written onto the descendants of Europeans whether [they] like it or not, for [their] bodies represent the destruction of other, Indian bodies: those killed in the past, and their absent descendants. This embodied history of domination has afforded white European anthropologists working in the Andes better access to sources, even as white bodies can also be perceived as "monstrous." The anthropologist Mary Weismantel recounts how one of her most unsettling discoveries when she arrived in the field in the 1980s was that she terrified small children. Their terror was rooted not in surprise at the appearance of a white European but in cultural references to encounters with violent and malicious whites; these references abound in all the genres of oral culture with which they were familiar—jokes, riddles, songs, ghost stories, and historical tales—allowing even a child to recognize her arrival as just one more skirmish in a long-standing, ongoing conflict. Indeed, the association between Western anthropologists and Western colonialism, imperialism, and oppression in the Andes has been so strong as to have produced an ethnographic trope: the mistaking of the foreign anthropologist for a *kharisiri* or *pishtaco*, an Andean vampiric being that sucks fat, which is conceptualized throughout the Andes as essential to life and vitality. These beings prey on indigenous Andeans and steal their fat to lubricate machines in the industrialized Global North, and they are usually imagined as solitary white Euro-American travelers, a description that often matches anthropologists; as recently as 2001, for example, the anthropologist Anders Burman was mistaken for a *kharisiri* when he was spotted waiting alone under a tree in the rural Andes.

The figure of the *kharisiri* aptly symbolizes how the ethnographic encounter often maps onto the colonial encounter, accompanying exploitation and asymmetrical power relations. Burman, for instance, describes the trope of “fat-stealing monster mirroring the colonial monstrosities of contemporary anthropology,” to develop a critique of anthropology as a “monstrous,” “kharisiri” discipline. Like *kharisiris*, he argues, anthropologists draw power from how we embody powerful global transnational actors, such as NGOs, states, corporations, or our universities and research councils. Through this, he argues, anthropology as it tends to be practiced today is an extractivist, Anglophone-centric, and colonial practice – and as such quite monstrous. A core part of Western imperial and colonial power has been the enforcement of whiteness within imperial borders and the building of a white national identity which, combined with the intellectual hegemony of the West, is fundamentally linked to the whiteness of the academy. Indeed, what particularly struck me in the field was how successfully Western nations such as the US have presented themselves as white. The author was told regularly during fieldwork that she “does not look American” – a comment that referred to her visible non-whiteness and that demonstrates the far reach of US racial prejudice, which has been a tool of Western colonialism for centuries.

**Oriol, Ambrigo:** Accusing and Identifying the *Kalku*. The Perception of Sorcery in Mapuche Society (Seventeenth to Eighteenth Centuries). *Ethnohistory* 68/3.2021: 385–405.

This article examines accusations of sorcery as a way to understand the perceptions of sorcery among the Mapuche of central-southern Chile during the colonial period. Local communities believed that illnesses and unfortunate events were caused by the actions of sorcerers, known as *kalku*, and therefore consulted ritual healers and diviners, the *machi* and *dugul*, to identify and punish the supposed evildoers. In accusing local members of being *kalku*, the ritual specialists expressed a precise perception of sorcery and developed clear strategies for counteracting the sorcerers. This article argues that the accusations of sorcery became political and social instruments in the hands of the local authorities and that they shaped the meaning of sorcery and its perception among the Mapuche.

Sorcery was a pivotal element in Mapuche culture, since it was believed that illnesses and death were caused by the actions of *kalku* that harmed others with the help of evil spirits. With the exception of violent deaths that occurred during military skirmishes, it was believed that every unfortunate event had the intervention of a human agent. To discover the culprits, the Mapuche resorted to the help of the *machi*, who, with divinatory abilities and medical remedies, could expel the *huecubu* that entered the body of the patient. The

Mapuche believed that *kalku* operated from within the community to destroy it with illnesses and death, which caused social disorder. Although early colonial Spanish authors depicted the *kalku* as sorcerers hidden in their caves during the day that sent the evil *huecubu* to harm others, the cases reported above demonstrate instead that locals believed that sorcerers were ubiquitous. In the vast majority of cases, the *kalku* were not distant but rather close; they were embedded in the community, and as integral members they could erode local social bonds attacking their own relatives. In addition, since evil spirits could possess everyone, the presence of sorcerers was unpredictable: they could hide behind wives, husbands, children, or relatives. For this reason, the community consulted the *dugul* to identify the sorcerers.

The Mapuche never accused members of powerful families of sorcery but, rather, started during the eighteenth century to accuse the poor and marginal members of the community. An increasing percentage of poor commoners who were unable to contribute wealth to the community became associated with sorcery. Social marginality and the lack of extended familial bonds obtained through multiple marriages transformed the poor into antisocial members accused of harming the community. The perception of social marginality and excessive poverty as a clear sign of sorcery was also a consequence of the demographic situation of late eighteenth-century Mapuche communities. An extremely high child mortality rate and the frequent internal conflicts threatened the survival of the Mapuche. Accusing the poor of sorcery was a way to limit conflicts and therefore population decline, since marginal members were helpless against the actions of the *gen lladcún* (the leader of the family of the victim) and they had no relatives that could avenge them. Accusing the outcasts and poor allowed Mapuche authorities to extirpate unproductive people and restore the social order based on the *admapu* (tribal ways) without violent consequences. The association between social marginality and sorcery contributed to the development of a new form of punishment of the *kalku*: they were sold to Spanish merchants in exchange for goods, a system that guaranteed a smooth and permanent expulsion of the undesired members along with a profit.

In the second half of the eighteenth century, Mapuche women became a target of the accusations of sorcery probably because of the existing association between women and sorcery in the Spanish towns. However, since the poor remained the group most exposed to these accusations, it is probable that the women who were accused, expelled, and sometimes killed for being sorcerers were unmarried and poor. Although late colonial religious sources reported a growing skepticism of Mapuche commoners toward the methods and strategies used by the ritual specialists to fight sorcery, the *machi* and *dugul* cultural explanations of the origin and cause of illnesses remained widely accepted.